## City of Gahanna: Community Choice Energy Aggregation - RFI Response Summaries

Requested Information Aspen	Dynegy	NOPEC	SOPEC
How are you registered with the PUCO? As a Council of Governments, a supplier, a CRES provider, or something else? Please describe.  Aspen Energy is registered with PUCO. Certification is a Clauding aggregator.	CRES Supplier Certificate Number: 04-124E Case Number: 04-1323- EL-CRS	The Northeast Ohio Public Energy Council (NOPEC) is a regional Council of Governments currently representing 240 member communities in 20 Ohio counties and is certified by the PUCO to provide the CRES-Governmental Aggregation services.	SOPEC is a Regional Council of Governments that is certified with the PUCO to provide competitive retail electric Governmental Aggregator services within the State of Ohio.
Is membership in your organization required to receive services? If so, does membership require participation in an aggregation program?	No a community needs to be certified to aggregate in the state of Ohio. And Dynegy works with brokers/communities to supply power for their aggregation programs.	Yes, membership in the aggregation program is required to have access to NOPEC's many member benefits.	Yes, membership in SOPEC is required to receive services. No, membership does not require participation in an aggregation program. For example, the City of Dayton joined SOPEC in May of 2021 and did not lock pricing for its electric aggregation program until February of 2022. The Dayton electric aggregation program then did not become active until June 1, 2022. SOPEC also has various additional programs that members can participate in.
If membership is required, please describe the charge, if any, associated with membership, how it is calculated, and how it is applied to services.	N/A	NOPEC provides a complete turnkey aggregation service. There are no additional charges or costs associated with NOPEC electric aggregation membership.	SOPEC does not have member dues.
How many communities in Ohio do you serve?  Currently serving 47 communities.	We have 394 communities serving 1.3 million customers in OH.	NOPEC is the largest public retail natural gas and electric energy aggregation in Ohio supplying energy to over 900,000 residential and small business customers in 240 communities across 20 Ohio counties.	
If your governance provides board seats to member communities, Is every community offered a seat on your Board? If not, how do communities participate in or influence decisions by the organization?	Istainable energy N/A to learn more about our company see https://hub.vistracorp.com/our-companies/	NOPEC is governed by a General Assembly, made up of one representative from each member community. From this group, a Board of Directors is elected with representatives from each county or region where NOPEC has active aggregation programs.	Every member of SOPEC has a seat on SOPEC's General Assembly. SOPEC also has a Board of Directors made up of the five largest communities, five regions of Ohio, and up to five at-large representatives. The City of Gahanna's population of 35,715 would currently make it one of the five largest community members in SOPEC.
Do you offer energy aggregation for both gas and electric?	In Ohio currently only electric.	Yes. NOPEC offers aggregation programs for both electric and natural gas. In fact, 71% of our member communities receive both commodities through NOPEC.	Yes.
Are communities required to use your Operations and Governance Plan? If not, do you offer assistance to update a communityy's plan?  Not required to use our Operations and Governance. Yes, update community's plan.	we will assist to  Each community has a plan and Dynegy can work with the community to draft / update one.	Yes. NOPEC's Plan of Operation and Governance (POG) has been prepared in compliance with Ohio law regarding government aggregation of electric consumers. The plan contains information on the structure, governance, operations, management, funding, and policies of the Aggregation Program to be utilized for participating customers in member communities.	The short answer is yes, a member community is required to use the SOPEC Plan of Operation and Governance. However, the use of SOPEC's existing Plan of Operation and Governance and certificate makes for an easier and quicker start to a program.
Is your pricing fixed or variable and how do rates change? Please describe the components of your rate.  We can offer Fixed for electric. Gas, we can offer fixed and an offer Fixed for electric. Gas, we can offer fixed and an offer Fixed for electric. Gas, we can offer fixed and an offer Fixed for electric. Gas, we can offer fixed and an offer Fixed for electric. Gas, we can offer fixed and an offer Fixed for electric. Gas, we can offer fixed and an offer Fixed for electric. Gas, we can offer fixed and an offer Fixed for electric. Gas, we can offer fixed and an offer Fixed for electric. Gas, we can offer fixed and an offer Fixed for electric. Gas, we can offer fixed and an offer Fixed for electric fixed and an offer fixed and an offer fixed f	In Ohio, most of our plans are fixed price for the term. In IL, a capacity pass through option does exist. Start months and the load factors of your communit will impact the price.	NOPEC currently offers two community default electric program options: 1). y NOPEC's Standard Program Price (SPP): a competitive rate that varies and is based on favorable wholesale purchase prices available in the market. NOPEC's SPP is 6.3 cents/kWh for June through December 2024 meter reads which is ~16% below AEP's current residential Price to Compare (PTC). 2). NOPEC's Green Community Choice Program: The price is NOPEC's Standard Program price plus a renewable content adder. The electricity supplied through this program is backed by Green-e Certified 100% Renewable Energy Credits (RECs).	SOPEC pricing is fixed. SOPEC works with its communities to lock in competitive, fixed-term pricing, for one to three years. Price stability is of primary concern. SOPEC understands that its communities should not be subject to unexpected price increases, which is why SOPEC does not utilize variable pricing. SOPEC and AEP Energy also have never terminated, canceled, or suspended an aggregation program prior to completion of engagement or expiration of full term. To ensure competitiveness, SOPEC pays special attention to the local utility auctions.
Do you offer a mix of plans from 100% renewable to a combination of brown and renewable options? Please describe your options.  We offer plans of 100% renewables or a combination of brown and renewable options? Please describe your options.	we offer green and brown options communities by providing opt in and opt out options.	t We currently offer our member communities two default options  Our Standard Program Price which currently* meets Ohio's Renewable Portfolio Standard (RPS) content requirement and our Green Community Choice Program which is 100% Green-e Certified REC-backed. Individual customers can also choose between several 100% renewable and standard product offerings with NOPEC's portfolio. *NOPEC recently announced that starting in 2025, we will begin incrementally ramping up the renewable content mix of our Standard Program Price product, maxing out at 50% renewable/REC backed content by the end of 2026.	All of SOPEC's member communities' electric aggregation programs feature 100% renewable energy. This is the default option in SOPEC Electric Aggregation Programs. However, SOPEC has provided a step-down 0% renewable energy electric option for all of its communities' programs. In addition, the SOPEC Electric Aggregation Program for the City of Cleveland features a 50% renewable energy option.

What is the average cost per kWh your communities are securing for 100% renewable electricity in 2023 and 2024?	\$.0686 per kWh	This is based upon start month, term length and size of load. Here is the PUCO filings per communities https://dis.puc.state.oh.us/CasesByIndustryPurposeStatus.aspx?ind code=All-purpose=GAG&status=OPEN&count=(485%20cases) and here is the website for current Dynegy programs https://www.dynegy.com/municipalaggregation/communitieswe-serve/Ohio and here are current Energy Harbor programs https://energyharbor.com/en/community-programs/find-your-program	Cents/KWh]	In 2023 and 2024, SOPEC member communities' electric aggregation programs had an average rate of 6.981 cents per kWh This average cost was determined by averaging all member communities' default price.
What is the average cost per kWh your communities are securing for mixed energy electric in 2023 and 2024?	\$.0694 per kWh	See communities listed above.	Average estimates for NOPEC's Standard Program for Jun23 - Dec24 = 6.47 Cents/KWh]	2023 and 2024 SOPEC member communities' electric aggregation programs: Average of the step-down non-100% renewable energy option is 6.628 cents per kWh.
12 Please describe your enrollment process for an opt-out aggregation program and how it meets statutory requirements.	Each eligible customer will be mailed an Opt-out letter which gives them 21 days to opt-out of the program. If no answer that meter will be enrolled into the program. Anyone can call after 21 day period to remove themselves from the program or jump back into the program with no fees.	The opt out process in OH is 21 days. Lists from the utilities are pulled 30 days before the opt out process begins and we target the start months of the program. If a customer wants to opt in opt out of the program at any time we allow that	NOPEC/NextEra will seamlessly conduct all aspects of the opt- out process in compliance with PUCO requirements including preparing initial and refresher opt-out notices, submitting the opt-out materials to the PUCO, mailing the opt-out notices to customers, receiving the opt out requests, and finalizing the aggregation customer enrollments. Subject to PUCO rules and as time permits, NOPEC is willing to customize the enrollment letters for the City of Gahanna.	All eligible residents and small businesses in the SOPEC community are automatically enrolled in the SOPEC Electric Aggregation Program unless they choose to opt out. They do not need to take any action. However, they receive a joint notice (opt-out letter) from SOPEC and the community which details the SOPEC Electric Aggregation Program's terms. If an eligible customer decides the program is not right for them, then they may opt-out, free of charge. Upon receiving the joint notice (opt-out letter) from SOPEC and the community, they have a 21-day window of time (per PUCO rules) to make the decision.
13 Who is your electric supplier? Do you have a one supplier for all of your programs, or is it variable? If variable, please describe your selection process and how you ensure consumer cost protection.	We have a total of 6 electric aggregation suppliers.	We are a CRES supplier and generator.	NOPEC routinely conducts a stringent process that requires potential suppliers to comply with our financial, legal, and insurance standards: the highest standards in the business. As a result of that process, NOPEC chose NextEra Energy Services Ohio, LLC. (NextEra) as the sole electric aggregation supplier to serve our aggregation's customers.	AEP Energy has been the exclusive electric supplier to SOPEC since 2015. The SOPEC and AEP Energy relationship is built around trust and transparency. With over 250 dedicated energy professionals employed by AEP Energy, approximately 50 of them support SOPEC aggregation programs in some fashion. SOPEC and AEP Energy have a Government Aggregation Master Retail Electric Supply Agreement.
14 What sources are used to produce electricity from your supplier? What percent of generation is from Ohio-based generators and what fuel/technology is used to produce that electricity?	Typical source will be a mix of sustainable energy, coal, nuclear, and natural gas for brown energy. We can also offer 100% Green energy programs if the community desires.	With a capacity of approximately 41,000 megawatts powered by a diverse portfolio, including natural gas, coal, nuclear, solar, and battery energy storage facilities.	Ohio's electric distribution utilities (EDUs) are members of the regional transmission organization (RTO) PJM Interconnection, which coordinates wholesale electricity markets and manages the high-voltage electricity grid for over 65 million people. As a result, Ohio receives electricity from a broad geographic area that is generated using both nonrenewable and renewable resources. In the region covered by PJM Interconnection, the generation is broken down into these renewable and nonrenewable resources: Natural Gas – 46.6%, Coal – 24%, Nuclear – 17.7%, Oil – 3.5%, Renewables – 8.3%. Because instate generation does not meet consumer demand, Ohio typically imports between about one-fifth and one-fourth of the electricity it needs each year from other states and Canada by way of the regional grid. (U.S. Energy Information Administration) Source: https://www.eia.gov/state/analysis.php?sid=OH	The electricity supplied by AEP Energy for SOPEC comes from the system mix of generation resources coordinated by PJM, the regional grid operator for the midatlantic region, of which Ohio is a member, along with 12 other states and the District of Columbia. Electricity generation in PJM is made-up of natural gas (44%), nuclear (33%), coal (15%), wind (4%), hydro (2%) solar (1%) and other (1%). The amount of power coming from generation resources located in Ohio is constantly changing and will vary over months and years. Because PJM continues to rely on carbon emitting generation resources like natural gas and coal, SOPEC will procure Renewable Energy Certificates (or credits) ("RECs") to obtain electric aggregation programs featuring 100% renewable energy.
15 Please describe the variables that impact the cost of electricity from your supplier (i.e. quantity, time of use, source, etc.).	Quantity, duration of term, national energy market, source.	Quantity, start and stop month of contracts, load profiles (mix of customers)	While many factors impact the price of electricity, residents will not be charged any additional fees by NOPEC or NextEra outside of their respective program rates. Several key factors influence the price of electricity from our supplier: • Fuels: Fuel prices, especially for natural gas and petroleum fuels (mainly in Hawaii and villages in Alaska), may increase during periods of high electricity demand and when fuel supply constraints or disruptions occur because of extreme weather events and accidental damage to transportation and delivery infrastructure. Higher fuel prices, in turn, may result in higher costs to generate electricity.	overall price. The largest variable is the actual cost of the energy which is driven by electricity markets that are influenced by supply and demand dynamics, weather, fuel prices, consumer behavior, and other regulatory factors. Natural gas and electricity prices are highly correlated because the former is the primary fuel source used the most for power generation. Other non-energy variables can also impact the overall electricity price, including capacity, ancillaries, line losses,
16 What are your sustainability goals and how does your energy purchasing through aggregation align with those?	Aspen strives to keep documentaries digital as much as possible to limit environmental impact.	https://vistracorp.com/sustainability/	At NOPEC, we strive to create a sustainable and resilient region. Embracing our communities' diverse needs, we pledge to meet each community where they are in their sustainability journey, empowering them with innovative, tailored energy solutions.	SOPEC's mission is to provide simple, valuable, and reliable public energy programs that help our communities achieve their local energy and sustainability goals. SOPEC does not have just one employee focused on sustainability, but rather SOPEC's entire team views everything through a sustainability lens. It is who we are. SOPEC is committed to tailoring each new member community's program to fit that community's desires and unique needs. SOPEC specializes in creative and innovative approaches to meet the sustainability goals of its communities, as illustrated by the features of the cities of Athens and Dayton electric aggregation programs.

loans to public or private sector consumers? Do you offer sustainability incentives or educational programs for community member residents? Is the cost of this programming factored into the retail price a customer will pay?	We can offer an Ohio Civic Grant for electric. The amount can be determined by the community. We can also customize grant programs for energy efficiency for specific communities.	of the programs. The amount depends on the load of the community and the contract term.	communities at no additional cost to customers: NOPEC is dedicated to supporting economic development in our NOPEC member communities. • Low interest loans (PACE & STEP) for energy improvement projects on commercial, municipal, and industrial buildings, with funding available up to \$1,000,000. • NOPEC's Small Business Energy Audit Program covers 60% - 100% of the cost of a qualifying energy audit, providing small business owners with recommendations that will help them reduce their energy usage and save on energy costs. • NOPEC's list of Preferred Energy Audit Partners are trusted, Ohio-based firms, that offer priority status and guaranteed response times, making energy audits more accessible to small businesses and municipalities. NOPEC provides educational support and resources throughout Ohio to help energy consumers understand their energy choices and to provide educational opportunities to Ohio students. • Through NOPEC's Energy Explorers Library Program, we work with local libraries to provide energy-related reading materials and hands-on learning programs for young learners. • We've helped energize classrooms for over 10,000 students since 2016 by sponsoring Ohio Energy Projects. • Our Community Outreach teams bring our Energy Education Station to events across Ohio, engaging with residents, answering questions and providing informational resources. Please see additional information in the Appendix.	helping them prepare, at no cost, for a USDA Rural Energy for America Program (REAP) grant that can provide up to 50% of total eligible project costs back to for-profit businesses and agricultural operations who invest in renewable energy systems or make energy efficiency improvements.  Yes, SOPEC offers a wide range of sustainability incentives and educational programs for SOPEC communities and their residents. All of these incentives and educational programs are already factored into the retail price a customer will pay, meaning, they are services all SOPEC Electric Aggregation Programs may utilize as a standard element of the Programs. For example, in Upper Arlington, SOPEC has hosted multiple public information sessions, online and in-person, in addition to the public hearings required by the PUCO. Providing educational information for the public helps create a smoother process. SOPEC was one of the first aggregators in Ohio to allow net metering in all of its electric aggregation programs. SOPEC negotiated on-bill repayment as a feature of its electric aggregation Master Retail Electric Supply Agreement. SOPEC has assisted member communities to become EPA Green Power Partnership communities. SOPEC has assisted member communities to become EPA Green Power Partnership communities within Ohio. These 19 communities supplied by SOPEC utilize Green-e® Renewable Energy Certificates (RECs). SOPEC also is happy to assist its member communities in achieving SolSmart designation or advancing their current designation to a higher status. SolSmart is a United States Department of Energy funded program that recognizes cities, countles, and regional organizations for making it faster, easier, and more affordable to go solar. Community grants are optional for member communities as part of program design. Grants may be spent however each member community chooses. This is provided directly by SOPEC. Recent examples of community grants include: solar for the Athens County ENS station (which is net zero), sustainability fello
What is your call center volume, wait times, and dropped call rates?	At Aspen Energy, we prefer to take calls to help people understand the program options and assist in being added or removed from the aggregation. Residents can call the supplier as well at any time to get added or drop out of the program.	As of June 10 our service level is 90% with an abandon % of 3% of calls. Average speed to answer is 26 secs.	The NOPEC Customer Care Center staffing, located in Marquette, MI, includes a dedicated core team of over 20 FTE call center agents, a Team Supervisor, and NOPEC Customer Service Program Manager who are experienced with all NOPEC gas and electric program specifics and equipped to handle any questions a customer may have regarding any aspect of the program. This team also maintains the online chat function available on the NOPEC website. The Call Center staffing levels are based on strict Service Level Agreement (SLA) standards. Our agents are available to answer calls 24 hours/day, 7 days/week. This team maintains a very high level of Customer Service with an average quality score of 98% YTD. Average annual call volume is 5,580 calls. The average wait time is an average of 8.3 seconds with a dropped call rate of less than 0.001%. The NOPEC call center utilizes a translation service and can support English and Spanish, as well as other languages as needed.  NOPEC also has the ability to pull and monitor calls as needed at any time. Our operations team monitors weekly dashboard reports of the call center performance during peak periods, and throughout the year.  All complaints are assessed and addressed within 1 business day.	SOPEC understands the importance of providing exceptional customer service to all of Gahanna's residents and small businesses. SOPEC's program provides multiple easy to use and accessible options for residents and small businesses to interact and resolve potential issues. SOPEC's exclusive electricity supplier, AEP Energy, has a toll-free phone line dedicated for SOPEC customers. SOPEC and AEP Energy's team of Customer Care Advocates will be on staff Monday through Friday, 8:00 am – 7:00 pm and Saturday 9:00 am – 1:00 pm to handle any issues, along with after-hours care options. Residents and small businesses can reach us by phone, online chat, mail, email, or social media. SOPEC understands the City
Do you have any active complaints with the PUCO on your program? If so, how many and are there any resolutions?	No active complaints with PUCO.	Our complaint process and resolution time to PUCO Is 3 business days. At this time, we do not have an open PUCO complaint with Dynegy.	Any PUCO complaints are handled within 4-8 hours of notification. As of June 1, 2024, there is one open docketed complaint with the PUCO that is in process of being resolved.	
	The bill will show the selected supplier with the aggregation rate. No additional charges will happen for residents in the aggregation program.	No the City is not on the bill. The Dynegy logo appears with the consumed kwh times the agreed upon price and the total amount.  Quantity time price = total amount due.	Yes, AEP bills show NOPEC/NextEra as the supplier. There are no additional fees – customers are charged only for the energy they use during that billing period. See copy of AEP sample bill included in appendix.	Electric aggregation customers are billed the same way they are billed when they are on their local utility's standard service offer, with the exception that the supply charges on their bill are specific to the electric aggregation program's rate and their bill will indicate that their supplier is AEP Energy. There will not be an additional charge on the monthly bill.
Are there any deposit requirements for programs your communities have used?	No deposit is required.	No Deposits required.	There are no deposit requirements for consumers or the City for any of the programs or services NOPEC provides.	No.

Does your standard aggregation contract allow for residents to participate in net metering? Please provide example language.	We have suppliers that allow net metering. Not all suppliers offer net metering.	Customers on net metering can be in the program and will receive a credit up to zero for the monthly negative amount	o All electric customers can participate in net metering. More information on AEP Ohio's net metering policy can be found by visiting https://www.aepohio.com/lib/docs/cleanenergy/renewable/NetEnergyMeteringService2-10-2020.pdf.	Yes, net metering is a feature in all SOPEC Electric Aggregation Programs and to the customers in those programs. Each billing month, when a customer's electricity consumption exceeds on-site solar generation, AEP Energy will charge for any net consumption of electricity supply at the aggregation program rate per kilowatt-hour (kWh). When a customer's on-site solar generation exceeds electricity consumption, AEP Energy will credit customers for net solar production onto the local grid at the aggregation program rate per kWh. For more information, see: https://www.sopec-oh.gov/solar-net-metering
How do you directly pursue federal grant funding or support local governments in pursuing federal grants? Please share any relevant information on federal grant awards you have received or have applied for.	N/A	We do not work with the communities on grants. We do offer a greenback program if interested in receiving rebates for green initiatives. This is based upon the aggregation size load and contract term.	NOPEC pursues federal grant funding and supports local governments in pursuing federal grants in a number of ways. NOPEC has capabilities on staff in the areas of grant research and writing, and "stands" as the applicant of record when appropriate for state, regional, and federal grant pursuits. In other circumstances, NOPEC can be the "pass through agency" as a council of governments, and coordinates with internal grant writing resources as well as McCaulley & Company, a statewide federal agency resource and consulting firm, to pursue funds.	SOPEC is building a formidable grant writing team, and the results this last year have been exciting and demonstrated this fact. SOPEC's Director of Grants and Development, Dana Vingris, has been exceptional in her leadership in pursuing federal grants. SOPEC is also in the process of bolstering this team, with the hiring of two grants managers, a grants specialist, and the addition of outside grants administration consulting support. This equates to additional support for SOPEC members in pursuing federal grant dollars. SOPEC has received or supported over \$20 million in successful grants in the last six months. SOPEC is also supporting state and coalition applications that are responsible for hundreds of millions of dollars. Recent examples of federal grant awards SOPEC has received:  • March 2024 - SOPEC received a grant (\$100,000) from the United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) Rural Development Office of Ohio, Renewable Energy Development Assistance (REDA) grant program to offer free solar assessments and technical assistance for rural small businesses and agricultural producers across Ohio, in addition to urban farms that meet the criteria. SOPEC has received five rounds of funding for REDA with the first occurring in 2016.  • September 2023 - SOPEC received a grant (\$496,640) from the United States Department of Agriculture REAP Technical Assistance Grant Program, to manage the REAP LEAP program and to provide REAP Grant technical assistance to qualified rural small businesses and agricultural producers in the State of Ohio. January 2024 - SOPEC received a grant (\$12,545,691) from the United States Department of Transportation Charging and Fueling Infrastructure Discretionary Grant Program (CFI gram), which will fund projects to strategically deploy publicly accessible electric vehicle charging and alternative fueling infrastructure in urban and rural areas, and to support and bridge gaps in the electric vehicle infrastructure across southern Ohio.
Do you charge a fee for a participant to leave the aggregation program in the middle of the contract period?	No fees for residents or business at any time to leave aggregation program.	No	NOPEC does not charge a termination fee for any customer who wishes to leave the aggregation program at any point during the term of the contract.	No.
When during the contract period can a resident join the aggregation program if they were not initially included at the beginning of the program?	Residents can join anytime during the contract period with no fees.	Yes	Customers can opt-in to the NOPEC electric aggregation program at any time without fees or charges and can change products at any time without penalties.	A resident can join the aggregation program any time after the initial 21-day optout period that is provided per PUCO guidelines.
How many times can a customer leave the aggregation plan and then return with no cost?	Unlimited.	There is no limit to the times the customers can come or go into the programs.	Customers can leave and rejoin the aggregation program as many times as they like without the fees or penalties.	There is no limit.
Will all residents who own the solar panels on their roof maintain the net metering relationship with AEP? OR do you offer an alternative plan?	All residents will maintain net metering relationship with AEP as long as community would prefer a net metering supplier.	The residents can choice to join the aggregation or stay with the utility.	Residents will maintain their net metering relationship with the utility.	Yes, residents who own solar panels on their room will maintain the net metering relationship with AEP Ohio.

£